# Table of Contents

**About the Editors** .................................................................................. vii  
**About the Contributors** ......................................................................... ix  
**Table of Chapters** .................................................................................. xi  
**Table of Contents** .................................................................................. xiii

## Chapter 1  ERISA Causes of Action ......................................................... 1

Q 1.1 What are the most common ERISA causes of action? ...................... 2  
Q 1.2 What rights or duties are at issue in claims for denial of benefits? ................................................. 3  
  Q 1.2.1 Who are the proper parties in a claim for denial of benefits? ....................................................... 4  
  Q 1.2.2 What are common allegations in claims for denial of benefits? ................................................... 4  
  Q 1.2.3 What elements must a plaintiff generally establish in a claim for denial of benefits? .................. 5  
  Q 1.2.4 What relief is available for claims for denial of benefits? ............................................................ 6  
Q 1.3 What rights or duties are at issue in breach of fiduciary duty claims? ....................................................... 6  
  Q 1.3.1 Who are the proper parties in a claim for breach of fiduciary duty? ............................................... 8  
  Q 1.3.2 What are some common allegations in a claim for breach of fiduciary duty? ............................... 8  
  Q 1.3.3 What elements must generally be proved to prevail in a claim for breach of fiduciary duty? .......... 8  
  Q 1.3.4 What relief is available? ............................................................................................................... 9  
Q 1.4 What rights or duties are at issue in knowing participation claims? ....................................................................... 10  
  Q 1.4.1 Who are proper parties in claims for knowing participation in a violation of ERISA? .................... 10  
  Q 1.4.2 What are common allegations in knowing participation actions? .................................................. 10

xiii
Q 1.4.3 What elements must a plaintiff generally establish? ................................................................. 10
Q 1.4.4 What relief is available? .................................................................................................................. 11
Q 1.5 What rights or duties are at issue in interference claims? ................................................................. 11
Q 1.5.1 Who are the proper parties for an interference claim? .................................................................. 12
Q 1.5.2 What are some common types of interference actions? ................................................................. 12
Q 1.5.3 What elements must a plaintiff generally establish? ................................................................... 12
Q 1.5.4 What relief is available? .................................................................................................................. 13
Q 1.6 What common law claims may be made under ERISA? .................................................................... 13

Chapter 2 ERISA Actions in Federal Court ................................................................................................ 17
Q 2.1 How does ERISA interact with state and local laws governing contract, employment, insurance, and other areas? ........................................................................................................................................ 18
Q 2.2 Does ERISA preempt state laws? ........................................................................................................ 18
Q 2.2.1 What is the scope of ERISA’s preemption? ...................................................................................... 18
Q 2.3 What civil remedies does ERISA exclusively provide? ...................................................................... 19
Q 2.3.1 What does it mean for a state law to “relate” to ERISA? ................................................................. 19
Q 2.3.2 What does it mean for a state law to “refer” to ERISA? ................................................................. 20
Q 2.3.3 What does it mean for a state law to have a connection to ERISA? ................................................ 21
Q 2.3.4 Which state laws are excepted from ERISA preemption? .............................................................. 21
Q 2.3.5 Are employer-funded ERISA plans subject to state insurance laws? ........................................... 22
Q 2.3.6 What indicates whether a law regulates insurance so as to avoid preemption under ERISA? ...... 22
Q 2.4 Who has standing to bring an ERISA suit? ....................................................................................... 23
Q 2.4.1 Who has standing to sue for monetary relief for breach of fiduciary duty claims? ..................... 23
Q 2.4.2 Who has standing to sue for equitable relief? ................................................................................. 25
Q 2.4.3 What parties have standing to sue based on information requests? .............................................. 25
Q 2.4.4 Are any other parties allowed to bring ERISA suits? ................................................................... 26
Q 2.5 Are ERISA actions in state court subject to removal? ....................................................................... 26
Q 2.6 How does a defendant remove an ERISA case? ............................................................................... 28
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 3  Class Action Litigation

Q 3.1 Why would a plaintiff bring a class action in an ERISA case? .......................................................... 32

Q 3.2 What types of ERISA claims are brought as class actions? ................................................................. 33

Q 3.2.1 Can a claim for breach of fiduciary duty under ERISA § 502(a)(2) be brought as a class action? ........ 33

Q 3.2.2 Can a claim for individual relief under ERISA § 502(a)(3) be brought as a class action? ............. 33

Q 3.3 What are the requirements for the certification of an ERISA class? ......................................................... 33

Q 3.3.1 What issues or classes can be certified? ................................................................................................. 34

Q 3.3.2 When does class certification occur? .................................................................................................. 34

Q 3.4 What are the requirements of Rule 23(a)? ............................................................................................... 34

Q 3.4.1 What is required under Rule 23(a)(1)? ............................................................................................... 34

Q 3.4.2 What is required under Rule 23(a)(2)? ............................................................................................... 35

Q 3.4.3 What is required under Rule 23(a)(3)? ............................................................................................... 36

Q 3.4.4 What is required under Rule 23(a)(4)? ............................................................................................... 36

Q 3.4.5 Is there interplay among the four requirements of Rule 23(a)? ............................................................. 37

Q 3.4.6 When an ERISA breach of fiduciary duty claim is based upon representations made to beneficiaries, what class certification issues arise under Rule 23(a)? ................................................................. 38

Q 3.4.7 How do potential defenses affect the requirements of Rule 23(a)? .................................................. 39

Q 3.5 What are the requirements of Rule 23(b)? ............................................................................................... 39

Q 3.5.1 How can a plaintiff meet the requirements of Rule 23(b)(1) in an ERISA case? .............................. 40

Q 3.5.2 How can a plaintiff meet the requirements of Rule 23(b)(2) in an ERISA case? .............................. 40

Q 3.5.3 How can a plaintiff meet the requirements of Rule 23(b)(3) in an ERISA case? .............................. 42

Q 3.5.4 What is the practical effect of having a class certified under Rule 23(b)(1), 23(b)(2) or 23(b)(3)? ........ 43

Q 3.6 Are jury trials available in class action cases? ......................................................................................... 43

Q 3.7 What unique issues arise in settlement of ERISA class actions? ............................................................ 43

Q 3.7.1 How effective are releases of liability in class situations? ................................................................. 44

Q 3.7.2 What exempts class action settlements from ERISA’s prohibited transaction provisions? ............ 44
Chapter 4  Fiduciary Duties Under ERISA.........................................................47
Q 4.1 What does it mean to be a “fiduciary” of an ERISA plan?.................48
Q 4.2 How does a person or an entity become a “fiduciary”
of an ERISA plan? ..................................................................................48
Q 4.2.1 What makes someone a “named” or “designated”
fiduciary? ........................................................................................................49
Q 4.2.2 What does it mean to function as a fiduciary by
exercising discretionary authority or control? ..................................49
Q 4.3 When is someone a fiduciary for certain purposes
or particular actions? ..................................................................................49
Q 4.4 How many fiduciaries must an employee
benefit plan have? .....................................................................................51
Q 4.5 For what is a fiduciary responsible? ....................................................51
Q 4.6 For what is a fiduciary liable? ................................................................51
Q 4.7 How does a fiduciary terminate its fiduciary status
arising from being a named or designated fiduciary? ........................52
Q 4.7.1 How does a fiduciary formally terminate
its fiduciary status? .......................................................................................52
Q 4.7.2 How does a fiduciary unequivocally terminate
its fiduciary status? .......................................................................................53
Q 4.7.3 How does a fiduciary ensure that its resignation or
termination of fiduciary status is in compliance
with plan documents? ..................................................................................53
Q 4.7.4 What are a fiduciary’s obligations after
resigning or terminating its fiduciary status? ........................................54
Q 4.7.5 Must a resigning fiduciary appoint a
successor fiduciary? ....................................................................................54
Q 4.7.6 Must a resigning fiduciary disclose material
information necessary for the protection
of the plan upon termination? ................................................................55
Q 4.7.7 Must a resigning fiduciary investigate the
successor prior to termination? ...............................................................55
Q 4.8 How does a fiduciary terminate its fiduciary status
arising from the performance of fiduciary functions? ........................55
Q 4.9 Can fiduciary responsibility be waived? .............................................56
Q 4.10 Can fiduciary responsibility be delegated? ........................................56
Q 4.10.1 Does the fiduciary have ongoing responsibilities
with respect to these delegations? ..........................................................57
Q 4.11 What does it mean to be a fiduciary with a duty
of loyalty to plan beneficiaries under ERISA? ........................................58
Q 4.11.1 What is the standard of loyalty required of fiduciaries? ....58
Table of Contents

Q 4.11.2 Can a fiduciary have interests adverse to those of plan beneficiaries? ....................................................58
Q 4.11.3 Can an employer-trustee invest trust assets in its own securities? ........................................................59
Q 4.11.4 Can a fiduciary with a conflicting interest ever make decisions that are adverse to the interests of the beneficiaries? .................................................................59
Q 4.11.5 To what extent do fiduciary duties apply during plan creation and amendment? ......................................60

Q 4.12 What is the duty to disclose information and avoid misrepresentations? ........................................................61
Q 4.12.1 What is “material information”? ........................................................................................................62
Q 4.12.2 Does the duty to disclose information extend to future plans or plan amendments? ..........................62
Q 4.12.3 Is the duty to disclose violated if no one asks for information specifically? .........................................63
Q 4.12.4 What information does a fiduciary not have to disclose? ........................................................................64
Q 4.12.5 What actions may plan beneficiaries take if this duty is violated? .........................................................64

Q 4.13 What is the duty to manage plan funds in the interests of participants and beneficiaries? .........................64
Q 4.13.1 Can a fiduciary ever benefit personally from investment decisions made for the plan beneficiaries? ......................................................................................................................65
Q 4.13.2 What should a fiduciary consider when making investment decisions? ..................................................65

Q 4.14 What is the duty of prudence? ..................................................................................................................65
Q 4.14.1 How do courts interpret the duty of prudence? .........................................................................................66
Q 4.14.2 What is the duty to invest prudently and how does it relate to the duty to investigate? ..........................66
Q 4.14.3 How far must a fiduciary go to satisfy the duty to investigate? ..............................................................67
Q 4.14.4 To what extent can a fiduciary rely on expert assistance? ........................................................................67
Q 4.14.5 To what extent can a fiduciary rely on non-experts? ..............................................................................68
Q 4.14.6 How do courts assess the prudence of an investment? ............................................................................69
Q 4.14.7 How do courts determine the prudence of loans? .................................................................................69
Q 4.14.8 How do courts determine prudent management of Employee Stock Ownership Plans? .................70
Q 4.14.9 May a fiduciary decide to invest in the securities of the plan’s sponsor? ....................................................70
Q 4.14.10 What are the obligations of a fiduciary with respect to sell-back options? .......................................................... 71
Q 4.14.11 What qualifies as prudent purchasing of annuities in connection with plan termination? ......................... 71

Q 4.15 What is the duty to diversify? .......................................................... 72
Q 4.15.1 What is the purpose of the duty to diversify? ......................... 73
Q 4.15.2 How can violations of the duty to diversify be challenged? .............................................................................. 73
Q 4.15.3 What assets are subject to the duty to diversify? ............... 73
Q 4.15.4 Is the final distribution of assets of a plan subject to the duty to diversify? ......................................................... 74
Q 4.15.5 Are investments in employer securities, including employee stock ownership plans (ESOPs), subject to the duty to diversify? ........................................... 74
Q 4.15.6 Are annuities subject to the duty to diversify? ................ 74
Q 4.15.7 Are real estate and mortgages subject to the duty to diversify? ............................................................................. 74
Q 4.15.8 What is the scope of the duty to diversify?....................... 75
Q 4.15.9 In a claim for breach of the duty to diversify, what is the plaintiff’s burden? ......................................................... 75
Q 4.15.10 In defending a claim for breach of this duty, what is the defendant’s burden? ...................................................... 75

Q 4.16 What is the duty to act in accordance with the documents and instruments governing the plan? .................... 76
Q 4.16.1 In what circumstances have courts found this duty violated? .............................................................................. 76
Q 4.16.2 When a court finds that this duty was violated, what types of damages are awarded? ................................. 77
Q 4.16.3 How has this duty been construed by courts in claims for improper denial of benefits? .............................. 77
Q 4.16.4 Does this duty change if the plan documents and other ERISA provisions conflict? ................................. 78
Q 4.16.5 If a fiduciary violates other ERISA duties but acts in accordance with the documents and instruments governing the plan, has he violated the duty of loyalty? .......................................................... 78
Q 4.16.6 What should a fiduciary do if the plan documents contain provisions that partially conflict with an ERISA provision? .......................................................... 79
Q 4.16.7 How have courts construed language in plan documents granting fiduciaries discretionary authority? ..................... 79
### Table of Contents

Q 4.16.8  Is a grant of discretionary authority in unincorporated trust agreements or other instruments sufficient?.................................79

Q 4.16.9  How have courts construed a fiduciary’s authority to interpret and apply trustee-created rules?..........................................................79

Q 4.16.10 What is a fiduciary’s authority to interpret and define ambiguous terms in the plan document?.............................................................80

Q 4.16.11 What actions do not fall within the duty to comply with plan documents? .........................................................................................80

Q 4.16.12 Which documents and instruments govern the plan? .........................................................................................................................80

Q 4.16.13 Can an employee recover promised benefits even if the promise was not contained in a governing document?...............................81

### Chapter 5 Breach of Fiduciary Duty Litigation

Q 5.1  What actions are available for breach of fiduciary duty under ERISA?.................................................................................................88

Q 5.2  Who may bring a claim for breach of fiduciary duty? ..............................................................................................................................89
  Q 5.2.1  Who is a “participant”? .......................................................................................................................................................................89
  Q 5.2.2  Who is a “beneficiary”? .......................................................................................................................................................................90
  Q 5.2.3  Who is a “fiduciary”? ..........................................................................................................................................................................90

Q 5.3  Who may recover for breach of fiduciary duty? .................................................................................................................................91

Q 5.4  What remedies are available for a breach of fiduciary duty under ERISA? ..........................................................................................91
  Q 5.4.1  Are compensatory damages recoverable? ..................................................................................................................................................92
  Q 5.4.2  Are punitive damages recoverable? .......................................................................................................................................................92
  Q 5.4.3  Is restitution available? .......................................................................................................................................................................92
  Q 5.4.4  Can a fiduciary’s transaction in breach of its fiduciary duties be canceled or avoided? .................................................................93
  Q 5.4.5  Can the court impose a constructive trust? ...........................................................................................................................................93
  Q 5.4.6  Is an injunction available? .................................................................................................................................................................94

Q 5.5  What is the applicable statute of limitations? .................................................................................................................................94

Q 5.6  In what court can an action for breach of fiduciary duty be filed? .......................................................................................................95

Q 5.7  Is a jury trial available? ............................................................................................................................................................................96

Q 5.8  When can a § 502(a)(2) action on behalf of the plan be brought? .......................................................................................................96
Q 5.8.1 Who may bring a § 502(a)(2) action? .................................................96
Q 5.8.2 Who is a proper defendant in a § 502(a)(2) action? ...............96
Q 5.8.3 What relief is available in a § 502(a)(2) action? .................96

Q 5.9 When can a § 502(a)(3) action seeking individual relief be brought? .................................................................97
Q 5.9.1 Who may seek individual relief under a § 502(a)(3) action? .................................................................97
Q 5.9.2 Who is a proper defendant in a § 502(a)(3) action? .................97
Q 5.9.3 What relief is available in a § 502(a)(3) action? .........................97
Q 5.9.4 What is “other appropriate equitable relief”? .......................98
Q 5.9.5 What if relief is available under other ERISA provisions? ...........98

Chapter 6 Stock Drop Litigation ...........................................................101
Q 6.1 What are ERISA “stock drop suits”? ........................................102
Q 6.2 Which types of ERISA plans are permitted to invest in employer stock? ........................................................................102
Q 6.3 Which fiduciary duties apply to fiduciaries of EIAPs and ESOPs? ...........................................................................103
Q 6.4 What is the duty of loyalty? .........................................................104
Q 6.4.1 When does the duty of loyalty apply? .....................................104
Q 6.4.2 What facts do plaintiffs typically allege are indicative of a breach of the duty of loyalty? ...........................................105
Q 6.5 What obligations do the duties of prudence and loyalty encompass in stock drop litigation? .................................................106
Q 6.6 What is the duty to investigate and when does it arise? ..............106
Q 6.6.1 When does an ERISA fiduciary have a duty to investigate company affairs affecting stock value? .................................................106
Q 6.6.2 What does the duty to investigate investment decisions entail? ...........................................................................107
Q 6.7 What is the duty to monitor? .........................................................108
Q 6.7.1 How broad is the duty to monitor? ..........................................109
Q 6.7.2 What conduct does the duty to monitor require? .................109
Q 6.8 What is the duty to disclose? .........................................................110
Q 6.8.1 How does a claim for breach of the duty to disclose arise? .................................................................110
Q 6.8.2 When does an individual act as a fiduciary? .........................111
Q 6.8.3 How broad is the scope of the duty to disclose? ...................112
Q 6.9 What is the duty of prudence? ......................................................114
Q 6.9.1 What must a plaintiff show to establish a breach of the duty of prudence? .................................................................114
Table of Contents

Q 6.10 What is the *Moench* presumption? .................................................................114
  Q 6.10.1 In what context does the *Moench* presumption apply? ..........................115
  Q 6.10.2 At what stage of the litigation does the *Moench* presumption apply? ...115
  Q 6.10.3 Which circuits have adopted the *Moench* presumption? .......................115
  Q 6.10.4 What must a plaintiff show to rebut the *Moench* presumption? ................116
  Q 6.10.5 To what extent does the language of the plan documents affect the analysis of a duty of prudence claim? ..............................................................118
  Q 6.10.6 What test do courts use to determine whether a fiduciary acted prudently once the *Moench* presumption has been rebutted? .............................119
Q 6.11 What defenses are available to defendants in stock drop litigation cases? ......120

Chapter 7 ESOP Litigation .........................................................................................125
  Q 7.1 What is an ESOP? ...........................................................................................126
  Q 7.2 What are common types of litigation that involve ESOPs? .........................126
    Q 7.2.1 What do plaintiffs typically allege in a claim that an ESOP did not purchase stock for adequate consideration? .................................................127
    Q 7.2.2 What claims do plaintiffs typically assert in “stock drop” litigation involving an ESOP? .................................................................128
  Q 7.3 What is a “prohibited transaction”? ..............................................................129
  Q 7.4 What is “adequate consideration”? ...............................................................129
  Q 7.5 What does “good faith” mean? .......................................................................130
  Q 7.6 How are pension plans able to invest in employer securities in light of the prohibited transaction restrictions? .........................................................131
    Q 7.6.1 Can an ESOP own assets other than the employer’s stock? ..................131
    Q 7.6.2 Can an ESOP sell the employer’s stock? ...............................................132
  Q 7.7 How do courts determine whether it is imprudent to continue investing in employer stock? .................................................................132
    Q 7.7.1 Does a significant downward trend in the employer’s stock render it imprudent for a fiduciary to continue to invest in, or offer as an option investment in, the employer’s stock? .........................133
Q 7.8 What are “unusual circumstances” that may result in
a duty to sell the employer’s stock? ........................................133
Q 7.8.1 Does the employer have to be on the brink
of collapse before a fiduciary will be required
to sell the employer’s stock? ..................................................134
Q 7.9 With respect to public companies, is the fiduciary
required to consider any factors beyond the public price? ....134
Q 7.10 What other claims are typically brought related to ESOPs? ....134
Q 7.10.1 Under ERISA, how may a fiduciary be protected
from liability for plan losses? .................................................134
Q 7.10.2 Have courts rejected indemnification claims
made by ESOP fiduciaries? ..................................................135

Chapter 8 Cash Balance Plan Litigation ..................................139
Q 8.1 What is a cash balance plan? ...........................................140
Q 8.2 What are the potential litigation risks posed by moving
from a traditional pension plan to a cash balance plan? ..........141
Q 8.3 What are the most common ERISA claims relating to
cash balance plans? ..........................................................142
Q 8.4 What are courts doing with ERISA age discrimination
claims against employers that convert to
cash balance plans? ..........................................................142
Q 8.5 What legislative action has been taken to combat
anti-discrimination claims arising from
cash balance plan conversions? ...........................................143
Q 8.6 How does the anti-cutback rule apply to conversions
to cash balance plans? ........................................................143
Q 8.7 What is wearaway and what are its effects? .....................144
Q 8.7.1 What are the statutory and regulatory requirements
related to wearaway? .........................................................145
Q 8.7.2 How are courts treating wearaway claims by
plaintiffs? ........................................................................145
Q 8.7.3 What is the interplay between wearaway and
ERISA's anti-cutback rule? ................................................146
Q 8.8 What is the “whipsaw” calculation and how does it
apply to cash balance plans? ..............................................146
Q 8.8.1 What are courts doing with the “whipsaw” dilemma? .....148
Q 8.8.2 What are the remedies for improper whipsaw
calculations? ....................................................................148
Q 8.8.3 What is the “normal retirement age” for purpose
of the whipsaw calculation? ..............................................149
# Chapter 9 Prohibited Transaction Litigation

| Q 9.1 | What is a prohibited transaction? | 151 |
| Q 9.2 | Who is considered a party in interest? | 152 |
| Q 9.3 | Which types of transactions between a plan and a party in interest are prohibited? | 153 |
| Q 9.4 | Is a transaction still prohibited if a party-in-interest relationship ends before the dispersal of funds in connection with a potential loan? | 154 |
| Q 9.5 | What level of intent is required for a fiduciary to be liable for a prohibited transaction? | 155 |
| Q 9.5.1 | What additional level of intent is required for a fiduciary to be liable for a transfer of plan assets for the benefit of a party in interest? | 155 |
| Q 9.6 | Can a prohibited transaction occur if a third party was involved? | 155 |
| Q 9.7 | What constitutes prohibited “self-dealing” by a plan fiduciary? | 156 |
| Q 9.8 | Does good faith, legitimate business purpose or lack of harm cure an otherwise prohibited transaction? | 157 |
| Q 9.9 | Are there any exemptions from ERISA’s prohibited transaction bar? | 158 |
| Q 9.10 | What are statutory exemptions? | 158 |
| Q 9.10.1 | What types of prohibited transactions are subject to statutory exemptions? | 158 |
| Q 9.10.2 | What is considered a reasonable contract or arrangement entitled to relief under the statutory exemption? | 158 |
| Q 9.11 | What are class exemptions? | 159 |
| Q 9.11.1 | What types of prohibited transactions are subject to class exemptions? | 159 |
| Q 9.12 | What are individual exemptions? | 159 |
| Q 9.13 | How may fiduciaries have personal liability held liable for prohibited transactions under ERISA? [ED? Please confirm title?] | 160 |
| Q 9.14 | What penalties can the Department of Labor and the IRS assess for non-exempt prohibited transactions? [ED? Please confirm title?] | 160 |
| Q 9.15 | What are the private remedies available for a violation of prohibited transaction provisions that cause a loss of money or assets? | 160 |
| Q 9.16 | What are the private remedies available for a violation of prohibited transaction provisions that do not cause a loss of money or assets? | 161 |
Chapter 10 401(k) Fee Litigation .................................................................165

Q 10.1 What is 401(k) fee litigation? .........................................................166
Q 10.2 Who are the typical plaintiffs in 401(k) fee litigation? ..................167
Q 10.3 Do plaintiffs need to establish standing in fee litigation cases? ..........167
  Q 10.3.1 How do plaintiffs establish standing in fee litigation cases? ..............167
  Q 10.3.2 Can a named plaintiff establish standing on behalf of a class of past or future participants? ..............................................168
Q 10.4 Who are the typical defendants in 401(k) fee litigation? .................168
  Q 10.4.1 Who are typical corporate defendants in 401(k) fee litigation? ..........168
  Q 10.4.2 Who are typical individual defendants in 401(k) fee litigation? ........168
  Q 10.4.3 What particular issues relating to board committee and officer defendants arise in 401(k) fee litigation? .............................................169
  Q 10.4.4 Who are typical service provider defendants in 401(k) fee litigation? .................................................................169
  Q 10.4.5 What particular issues relating to service provider defendants arise in 401(k) fee litigation? .................................................169
Q 10.5 What are the typical claims brought in fee litigation? ......................170
  Q 10.5.1 How have plaintiffs alleged that defendants paid excessive fees? ........170
  Q 10.5.2 How have plaintiffs alleged that defendants failed to capture revenue streams? ..............................................................171
  Q 10.5.3 How have plaintiffs alleged claims for imprudent decision-making? .................................................................171
  Q 10.5.4 How have plaintiffs alleged that defendants engaged in prohibited transactions and breached the duty of loyalty? ........................................172
  Q 10.5.5 How do plaintiffs bring claims for failure to disclose or misrepresentation of excessive fees? ..............................................172
  Q 10.5.6 How have plaintiffs framed claims against defendants for holding excessive cash positions in company stock funds? .........................................173
Q 10.6 What type of relief do plaintiffs seek in fee litigation cases? ...............173
Q 10.7 What standards do courts use in determining if defendants paid excessive fees? .................................................................174
Q 10.8 How have courts adjudicated claims alleging the failure to disclose certain fee arrangements? ..................................................176
Q 10.9 What is the applicable statute of limitations in fee litigation cases? ..............................................................176
Q 10.10 Does ERISA’s safe harbor provision apply in fee litigation cases? .................................................................177

Chapter 11 Litigation to Recover Benefits Due Under a Plan ..........181
Q 11.1 Can a plan participant file a civil claim seeking benefits under an ERISA plan? .........................................................182
  Q 11.1.1 Under what circumstances do such claims typically arise? ...............................................................................183
  Q 11.1.2 What kinds of relief are available to a successful claimant? .................................................................183
Q 11.2 Who can bring claims for benefits? ..................................................183
  Q 11.2.1 Who is a “participant”? ..............................................................183
  Q 11.2.2 Who is an “employee”? ............................................................184
  Q 11.2.3 Who is a “beneficiary”? .............................................................184
  Q 11.2.4 May benefits available under an ERISA plan be assigned, and does an assignee have standing to bring a claim for benefits? .........................................................184
Q 11.3 Which provision discusses jurisdiction and venue for claims for benefits? ............................................................................185
Q 11.4 Does ERISA require exhaustion of claims review procedures as a prerequisite to bringing a claim for benefits? ............................................................................185
  Q 11.4.1 Are there any exceptions to the exhaustion requirement? ..............................................................................186
Q 11.5 Does ERISA address a participant’s or beneficiary’s entitlement to insurance proceeds? .........................................................186
Q 11.6 What other kinds of claims may accompany a claim seeking benefits? ........................................................................186
Q 11.7 Who may be sued in an action seeking ERISA benefits? ..........187
  Q 11.7.1 May a party other than an ERISA plan properly be named a defendant in a claim for benefits action? ........187
  Q 11.7.2 What is a “plan administrator”? ...................................................188
  Q 11.7.3 May a party other than the designated plan administrator be sued as a de facto plan administrator in a benefits action? .........................................................188
Q 11.8 What standard of review applies to a district court’s review of a plan administrator’s interpretation of plan terms? ............................................................................189
Q 11.9 What damages are available to a claimant in a benefits action? ........................................................................189
Q 11.9.1 Are claimants also entitled to additional relief, including consequential and punitive damages? ...............190
Q 11.9.2 Have district courts subsequent to Ingersoll-Rand Co. expanded the scope of available remedies? ..................191
Q 11.9.3 What kinds of relief are included in the equitable relief available in a benefits action? ......................191
Q 11.10 In a benefits action, under what circumstances is a party entitled to an award of costs and attorney’s fees? ....192
Q 11.10.1 Do courts consider whether the offending party has prevailed in the litigation in deciding to award attorney’s fees? .................................................................192
Q 11.10.2 Do courts consider the degree of bad faith or frivolity in deciding whether to award attorney’s fees? .................................................................192
Q 11.10.3 Do courts consider whether the party has been successful in the litigation in deciding to award attorney’s fees? .................................................................192
Q 11.11 What type of retirement income benefits can form the basis of a claim for benefits under ERISA? ...............193
Q 11.12 What is a defined benefit plan? ......................................................193
Q 11.12.1 What are the characteristics of a defined benefit plan? ......194
Q 11.12.2 When can a participant or beneficiary bring a claim for benefits under a defined benefit plan? ................195
Q 11.13 What is a defined contribution plan? .............................................195
Q 11.13.1 What are the characteristics of a defined contribution plan? .........................................................196
Q 11.13.2 When can a beneficiary bring a claim for benefits under a defined contribution plan? .....................197
Q 11.14 What type of welfare benefits can form the basis of a claim for benefits under ERISA? .........................197
Q 11.15 What standards of review do courts apply to an administrator’s decision denying benefits? .....................198
Q 11.15.1 How do courts determine which standard of review applies to a particular administrative decision? .............198
Q 11.15.2 How do courts determine whether a benefit plan gives the administrator discretionary authority? .............199
Q 11.15.3 Must the plan contain an express grant of discretion to warrant deference to the administrator’s decision? .................................................................................199
Q 11.15.4 What must a plan say to confer discretion or the plan administrator? ..................................................199
Q 11.15.5 Must discretion be granted to a plan administrator or fiduciary in a particular plan document? .....................200
| Q 11.16 | What factors do courts take into consideration when applying a de novo standard of review? | 202 |
| Q 11.17 | What determinations are subject to de novo review by courts? | 202 |
| Q 11.18 | What interpretive principles do courts use when interpreting ERISA plan documents? | 203 |
| Q 11.18.1 | Can courts consider extrinsic evidence when construing plan language? | 204 |
| Q 11.19 | When do courts apply an abuse of discretion standard of review to an administrator’s or fiduciary’s decision? | 204 |
| Q 11.19.1 | What factors do courts consider when applying the abuse-of-discretion standard of review? | 205 |
| Q 11.19.2 | What is the scope of evidence considered under the abuse-of-discretion standard of review? | 205 |
| Q 11.19.3 | When can a court remand a case for further administrative review? | 206 |
| Q 11.19.4 | What showing do courts require to sustain a denial of benefits? | 206 |
| Q 11.19.5 | What standard does a court apply in a deferential review of a plan administrator’s decision? | 206 |
| Q 11.19.6 | When is a plan administrator’s decision “reasonable”? | 207 |
| Q 11.19.7 | How does a court evaluate the “reasonableness” of a plan administrator’s decision? | 207 |
| Q 11.19.8 | What impact does a conflict of interest have on the evaluation of a fiduciary’s duties? | 209 |
| Q 11.19.9 | What constitutes a conflict of interest? | 209 |
| Q 11.19.10 | How does a conflict of interest impact the standard of review applied by the court? | 210 |
| Q 11.19.11 | What is the sliding scale standard? | 211 |
| Q 11.19.12 | What is the modified sliding scale standard? | 211 |
| Q 11.19.13 | What is the reasonableness approach? | 212 |
| Q 11.20 | Do courts impose a “treating physician rule” on administrators? | 213 |
| Q 11.21 | What is anti-cutback litigation? | 214 |
| Q 11.21.1 | What is ERISA’s anti-cutback provision? | 214 |
| Q 11.21.2 | How is a claim for violation of ERISA’s anti-cutback provision pled? | 215 |
| Q 11.21.3 | Who are proper parties in an anti-cutback claim? | 215 |
| Q 11.21.4 | What remedies are available for violation of ERISA’s anti-cutback provision? | 215 |
Chapter 12  Multiemployer Plan Litigation.................................223

Q 12.1  What is a multiemployer plan?..................................................224
  Q 12.1.1  What factors are relevant to determining whether a multiemployer plan is established for a substantial business purpose?.................................225
  Q 12.1.2  What kinds of plans may be structured as multiemployer plans? .................................................................225

Q 12.2  How are multiemployer plans controlled and administered?.................................................................226

Q 12.3  What claims may be brought against a participating employer in a multiemployer plan? ........226

Q 12.4  Which statutes govern multiemployer plans?........................................226

Q 12.5  How are multiemployer pension plans funded?.............................227

Q 12.6  What requirements does the Labor Management Relations Act impose on multiemployer plans?........228

Q 12.7  How does ERISA apply to multiemployer plans?..........................228

Q 12.8  What is the result of an employer’s exit from a plan?..........................229
  Q 12.8.1  What types of withdrawal exist?........................................230
  Q 12.8.2  What is complete withdrawal?............................................230
  Q 12.8.3  What is partial withdrawal?................................................230
  Q 12.8.4  Does the suspension of contributions constitute withdrawal?.........................................................................230
  Q 12.8.5  Is the sale of stock considered an employer withdrawal? .........................................................................................230

Q 12.9  How does the plan sponsor respond to an employer’s withdrawal?.................................................................................231
  Q 12.9.1  How is the employer’s withdrawal liability calculated?.........................................................................................231

Q 12.10  How does an employer respond to the plan sponsor’s imposed withdrawal liability?.................................232

Q 12.11  Are withdrawal disputes subject to mandatory arbitration?........232
  Q 12.11.1  What deference is given to the plan sponsor’s decision during arbitration? ..........................................................233

Q 12.12  When must the withdrawing employer begin to make payments?.................................................................234
  Q 12.12.1  Who is responsible for liability payments?.................................234

Q 12.13  What judicial review is available? ..............................................235
  Q 12.13.1  What remedies exist for collecting contributions?.................235

Q 12.14  What private causes of action exist for plan participants and beneficiaries?.................................................................236
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Q 13.1</th>
<th>What is an ERISA managed care plan?</th>
<th>240</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.1.1</td>
<td>What is utilization review?</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.1.2</td>
<td>What advantages do managed care plans offer over traditional benefits plans or fee-for-service arrangements?</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.1.3</td>
<td>What are some common criticisms of managed care plans?</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.2</td>
<td>When are employer-sponsors of managed care plans subject to ERISA liability?</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.2.1</td>
<td>When is an employer-sponsor of a managed care plan also considered the plan administrator?</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.2.2</td>
<td>Can an employer sponsoring a managed care plan be liable as an ERISA fiduciary if the employer is not formally designated as the plan administrator?</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.2.3</td>
<td>For what acts is an employer who is also a plan administrator subject to liability as an ERISA fiduciary?</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.3</td>
<td>Under what circumstances may an employer-administrator have obligations to plan beneficiaries under ERISA?</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.4</td>
<td>What are an employer-administrator’s obligations when denying or terminating healthcare coverage?</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.4.1</td>
<td>What information should be included in a denial/termination notice?</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.4.2</td>
<td>What happens if a qualified beneficiary does not receive adequate notice?</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.5</td>
<td>What are an employer-administrator’s obligations when considering amendments to a managed care plan?</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.6</td>
<td>What are an employer-administrator’s obligations upon termination of employment?</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.6.1</td>
<td>What is COBRA?</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.6.2</td>
<td>What is a “qualifying event”?</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.6.3</td>
<td>How should a discharged employee be notified of his or her COBRA rights?</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.6.4</td>
<td>What information should a COBRA notice contain?</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.6.5</td>
<td>What happens if a qualified beneficiary does not receive adequate notice?</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q 13.7</td>
<td>Do courts apply more stringent standards when reviewing decisions made by employers acting as plan administrators, as opposed to decisions made by non-administrator employers?</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Q 13.8 Can a non-administrator employer be held liable for the actions or decisions of the managed care plan or administrator chosen by the employer? ........................................... 249
Q 13.8.1 Is an employer-sponsor acting as an ERISA fiduciary when selecting a managed care plan? ................. 250
Q 13.8.2 Does ERISA protect an employer-sponsor alleged to be liable for the actions of a managed care plan or administrator? ......................................................... 250
Q 13.8.3 How can an employer-sponsor protect itself against possible liability for the actions of a managed care plan or administrator? ........................................... 252

Chapter 14 Discrimination and Interference with Benefits Rights Litigation ........................................................................ 255
Q 14.1 What provision of ERISA permits claims for discrimination or interference with benefits? .................. 256
Q 14.2 Who are the appropriate parties to a suit under § 510? ............... 257
Q 14.2.1 Who are proper defendants in an action under § 510? ........................................................................ 258
Q 14.2.2 Who is a proper plaintiff in an action under § 510? ........................................................................ 258
Q 14.3 What types of conduct are prohibited by ERISA § 510? ............... 259
Q 14.4 Are state law employment actions relating to benefits under an ERISA plan preempted by ERISA? ............... 260
Q 14.5 What is the applicable statute of limitations for a § 510 claim? ........................................................................ 261
Q 14.6 What are the elements of an action under ERISA § 510? .......... 262
Q 14.6.1 What is the direct evidence framework? ........................................................................ 263
Q 14.6.2 What is the indirect or McDonnell Douglas framework? ........................................................................ 263
Q 14.6.3 How does a plaintiff establish a prima facie case? .......... 264
Q 14.6.4 How does a defendant rebut the initial presumption of discrimination? ............................................ 264
Q 14.6.5 How does the plaintiff show that a proffered legitimate non-discriminating reason is pretextual? ......... 265
Q 14.7 What remedies are available to a plaintiff under ERISA § 510? ........................................................................ 267
Q 14.8 How does ERISA's anti-retaliation provision relate to other federal discrimination statutes? ....................... 267
Q 14.8.1 How does ERISA § 510 interact with the ADEA? .......... 268
Q 14.8.2 How does ERISA § 510 interact with the ADA? .......... 269
## Chapter 15  Litigation of Claims Arising Under Federal Common Law

| Q 15.1 | How does federal common law provide guidance to courts applying ERISA? | 273 |
| Q 15.2 | What justifies the federal judiciary’s power to develop federal common law, preempting state law, in ERISA cases? | 274 |
| Q 15.3 | What principles of law have courts looked to in developing ERISA federal common law? | 275 |
| Q 15.3.1 | How has trust law played a role in the development of ERISA federal common law? | 275 |
| Q 15.3.2 | How has agency law played a role in the development of ERISA federal common law? | 275 |
| Q 15.3.3 | How has contract law played a role in the development of ERISA federal common law? | 276 |
| Q 15.4 | What federal common law theories of liability do ERISA participants or beneficiaries most frequently raise? | 276 |
| Q 15.5 | Is a claim for restitution a permissible federal common law theory? | 276 |
| Q 15.5.1 | Are claims for restitution “at law” permissible? | 276 |
| Q 15.5.2 | What distinguishes restitution “at law” from equitable restitution? | 277 |
| Q 15.5.3 | Can non-fiduciary employers recover amounts mistakenly contributed to ERISA plans under a theory of restitution? | 277 |
| Q 15.5.4 | What factors do courts consider in balancing equities to decide whether to order restitution in a mistaken contribution case? | 278 |
| Q 15.5.5 | May non-fiduciary employers recover funds mistakenly contributed to ERISA plans under a theory of restitution? | 279 |
| Q 15.6 | Is a claim for rescission a permissible federal common law theory? | 279 |
| Q 15.7 | Are claims for indemnification or contribution permissible federal common law theories? | 280 |
| Q 15.8 | Is a claim for estoppel a permissible federal common law theory? | 280 |
| Q 15.8.1 | Can an estoppel theory be used to enforce oral representations about a plan? | 281 |
| Q 15.8.2 | Can an estoppel theory be used to enforce written representations about a plan? | 281 |
Q 15.8.3 Is a claim for estoppel treated differently in the context of a welfare benefit plan versus a pension plan? ................................................................. 281
Q 15.9 Is a claim for prejudgment interest a permissible federal common law theory? ................................................................. 282
Q 15.9.1 Are pension beneficiaries entitled to interest for denial of benefits where the benefits are later restored without resort to litigation? ........................................... 282
Q 15.10 Are principles of waiver permissible under federal common law? ................................................................................. 283
Q 15.11 What standard of review do courts apply when evaluating a plan administrator’s decision? ................................................................. 283
Q 15.12 Does federal common law permit the parties to a welfare benefit plan to determine when benefits vest or terminate? ................................................................................. 284
Q 15.13 What are the limitations on the development and use of federal common law in ERISA cases? ................................................................. 284
Q 15.13.1 Can courts develop federal common law that is inconsistent with ERISA’s language? ................................................................................. 284
Q 15.13.2 Can courts develop federal common law when ERISA is silent on an issue? ................................................................. 285
Q 15.14 Do courts, by use of federal common law, permit legal remedies? ................................................................................. 285

Chapter 16 Affirmative Defenses to ERISA Claims ................................................. 289
Q 16.1 What affirmative defenses are available to defend against an ERISA claim? ................................................................................. 290
Q 16.2 What is the § 404(c) safe harbor provision? ................................................................................. 290
Q 16.2.1 How does a plan qualify under § 404(c)? ................................................................................. 291
Q 16.2.2 Does § 404(c) apply to a fiduciary’s decisions about which options to offer? ................................................................................. 292
Q 16.3 Is a fiduciary’s delegation of a fiduciary function an affirmative defense to a breach of fiduciary duty claim based on the performance of that function? ................................................................................. 292
Q 16.4 What affirmative defenses apply when a fiduciary is accused of engaging in of the prohibited transactions in ERISA § 406? ................................................................................. 293
Q 16.5 What is the statute of limitations period for an ERISA claim? ................................................................................. 294
Q 16.5.1 What is the statute of limitations period for an action for breach of fiduciary duty? ................................................................................. 294
Q 16.5.2 What is the statute of limitations period for an action for wrongful denial of benefits under § 502(a)(1)(B)? ............................................................. 295
Q 16.5.3 What is the statute of limitations period for actions alleging interference with benefits in violation of § 510? ........................................................................ 296
Q 16.6 Can an ERISA claim be waived? .................................................... 297
Q 16.7 Who has standing to sue under ERISA? ........................................ 298
Q 16.8 Is failure to exhaust administrative remedies an affirmative defense to an ERISA claim? ................................................................. 299

Chapter 17 Limitations on Actions Under ERISA ...................................... 305
Q 17.1 May employers condition the receipt of employee benefits on a waiver of ERISA rights and claims? ...................................................... 306
Q 17.1.1 What factors determine the enforceability of a waiver of benefits? ............................................................................................. 306
Q 17.1.2 What constitutes a knowing and voluntary waiver? .................... 307
Q 17.1.3 Is any single factor in the knowing and voluntary test dispositive? ............................................................................................. 308
Q 17.1.4 When can a participant waive his or her spouse’s rights to pension death benefits arising under an ERISA plan? .............................. 308
Q 17.1.5 Does ERISA’s anti-alienation provision bar waivers of pension benefits? .......................................................... 308
Q 17.1.6 May employees waive prospective ERISA claims? .................... 309
Q 17.1.7 How do courts interpret the terms of a waiver? ......................... 309
Q 17.1.8 Can a party bring an ERISA claim after signing a waiver? ............ 310
Q 17.1.9 Can a party bring a claim on behalf of a plan after signing a waiver? ............................................................................................. 310
Q 17.2 Can an employer compel arbitration of employee benefits disputes? ............................................................................................. 310
Q 17.2.1 What factors determine the enforceability of a mandatory arbitration policy? ........................................................................... 311
Q 17.3 What is the statute of limitations for benefits claims? ..................... 312
Q 17.3.1 Is a contractual limitations period limiting the time to bring a lawsuit benefits claim enforceable? ............................................... 313
Q 17.3.2 What constitutes a “reasonable” limitations period? .................... 313
Q 17.4 What is the statute of limitations for breach of fiduciary claims? ............................................................................................. 313
Q 17.4.1 What constitutes actual knowledge for purposes of running the statute of limitations? ..................................................... 313
Q 17.4.2 Is there a different statute of limitations in a case of fraud or concealment?..................314
Q 17.4.3 Do federal equitable tolling principles apply?...............315

Chapter 18 Special Considerations for ERISA Litigation.........................319
Q 18.1 Is there a right to a jury trial under ERISA? .........................320
  Q 18.1.1 How do courts determine if a plaintiff seeks a legal or equitable remedy?..........................320
  Q 18.1.2 Is a claim for money damages a legal remedy? ..............320
Q 18.2 Does the right to a jury trial depend on which ERISA cause of action is being pled?................321
  Q 18.2.1 Is a jury trial available for a cause of action brought under ERISA § 502(a)(1)(B)? ..............321
  Q 18.2.2 What happens when a plaintiff brings ERISA claims and other claims that give rise to a jury right in the same lawsuit? ........................................322
Q 18.3 Is a jury trial available for a cause of action brought under ERISA § 502(a)(2)? ..................322
Q 18.4 Is a jury trial available when the cause of action is brought under ERISA § 502(a)(3)? ..............323
Q 18.5 Does an attorney-client privilege exist between a plan fiduciary and an attorney who provides legal advice?........323
Q 18.6 Are there ERISA-specific limitations or exceptions to the attorney-client privilege or other situations where the privilege might not attach?..................324
  Q 18.6.1 Is the fiduciary exception a waiver of the attorney-client privilege? ........................................324
  Q 18.6.2 Are there limits on when the fiduciary exception applies?..........................................................325
  Q 18.6.3 Are certain legal communications excluded from the fiduciary exception based on their substance? .............................................................326
  Q 18.6.4 Does the fiduciary exception apply to the work product doctrine? ...............................................327
Q 18.7 Is fee-shifting available in ERISA lawsuits?..........................327
Q 18.8 Must a party prevail in the litigation to recover its fees? ..........328
Q 18.9 In practice, which parties are mostly likely to receive a fee award? ..............................................328

Index ............................................................................................................331

xxxiv